

## European Union R&D subsidises for Israeli security actors

### Submission to the London Session of the Russell Tribunal on Palestine

**Ben Hayes, Statewatch, November 2010**

1. The EU is funding numerous Israeli corporations that profit directly from the occupation of Palestine.
2. These funds take the form of research and development (hereafter R&D) grants awarded by the European Commission under the European Union (hereafter EU) Seventh Framework Programme for Research (hereafter FP7).
3. FP7 runs from 2007-13 and has an indicative budget of €50.5 billion. Nine specific research themes are prioritised in FP7, including a new European Security Research Programme (hereafter ESRP). All full participants in FP7, including Israel, make a contribution to FP7 based on their gross domestic product.
4. The ESRP has an annual budget of €200 million. Although this submission focuses primarily on Israel's participation in the ESRP (in line with *Statewatch's* mandate to monitor civil liberties in the EU), it should be noted that many of the other eight FP7 themes have an important security component (particularly nanotechnology, space, transport, energy, information and communications technology, and social science). Additional EU funds for security-related R&D – for which Israel is also eligible – are available under a dedicated Critical Infrastructure Protection programme, from EURATOM (the European Atomic Energy Community), the €1.8 billion EU fund for the "Management of Migration Flows", and for components and applications of the Galileo (satellite navigation) system.
5. Israel participates in FP7 on an equal footing with the EU member states under the terms of an EC-Israel Association Agreement dating back to 1995 (last updated in 2004). In *per capita* terms, no non-EU country has received more from the FP7 programme than Israel. As the European Commission has observed, the EU is now second only to the Israel Science Foundation in Jerusalem as a source of research funding for Israeli academics, corporations and state enterprises. According to European Commission records, Israel has participated in more than 2,300 EU-funded research projects in the last ten years. By way of comparison, researchers in the Occupied Palestinian Territories feature in just 55 EU projects.
6. The ESRP is unlike other parts of the FP7 programme insofar as it has the twin objectives of both funding innovation in security-related R&D and enhancing the EU's "industrial competitiveness". In essence this means subsidising the development of the nascent European Homeland Security industry so that it can compete in an increasingly lucrative and global market place.
7. Unlike other aspects of FP7, the ESRP is managed by the European Commission's Directorate General (hereafter DG) for Enterprise and Industry (as opposed to DG Research). Extensive research by

*Statewatch* has documented the way in which corporations – particularly those from the defence and security industries – have been able to shape the ESRP to their advantage (see [Appendix 1](#)).

8. The Counter-Terrorism Bureau of the National Security Council of the State of Israel was among the 'stakeholders' invited to participate in the European Security Research and Innovation Forum (an informal, EU sponsored group tasked with identifying priorities for the ESRP).
9. To date the details of ninety ESRP contracts have been released under the FP7 programme. Since FP7 promotes cross-border research, almost all of these awards are to multinational consortia. Of the 90 ESRP projects funded to date, Israeli companies and institutions are participating in 19. Of these 19 projects, Israeli entities are leading six. By way of comparison, only four out of the 27 EU member states (France, UK, Germany and Sweden) lead more ESRP projects than Israel. The table in [Appendix 2](#) details Israeli entities involvement in the ESRP.
10. The ESRP projects in which Israeli entities participate concern counter-terrorism, border control, surveillance technology, homeland security and the emergency services. Some of this R&D concerns highly controversial elements and techniques of the global "war on terror", including mass-intrusive surveillance, repressive border controls, the use of 'drones' (also know as unmanned aerial vehicles) and 'counter-radicalisation' strategy.
11. Among the Israeli companies that feature in the aforementioned ESRP projects are *Israel Aerospace Industries* (a state-owned manufacturer of 'drones'), *Aeronautics Defense Systems* (another 'drone' manufacturer specialising in "networked warfare"), *Motorola Israel* (producer of 'virtual fences' around Israeli settlements), *Elbit Systems* (one of Israel's largest private military technology firms, responsible for segments of the 'Seperation Wall' around Jerusalem), *Verint Systems* (one of Israel's biggest Homeland Security exporters specialising in workplace surveillance, CCTV and wire-tapping facilities) and *Ernst & Young Israel*. See [Appendix 2](#) for further information.

## Appendix 1: Additional source of information

- ***Should the EU subsidise Israeli Security?*** (18.3.2010), Ben Hayes, European Voice, available at: <http://www.europeanvoice.com/article/imported/should-the-eu-subsidise-israeli-security-/67436.aspx>
- ***NeoConOpticon: The EU Security-Industrial Complex*** (2009), Ben Hayes, Transnational Institute/Statewatch, available at: <http://www.statewatch.org/analyses/neoconopticon-report.pdf>
- ***NeoConOpticon Blog – Israel***, available at: <http://neoconopticon.wordpress.com/tag/israel/>
- ***Briefing Paper: Security Co-operation between the EU and Israel*** (2010), Quaker Council for European Affairs, available at: <http://www.quaker.org/qcea/middle%20east/European%20Security%20Research%20Cooperation%20with%20Israel.pdf>
- ***Spain-Israel: Military, Homeland Security and Armament-Based Relations and trends*** (2010), Alejandro Pozo Marín, Centre d'Estudis per a la Pau/Justícia i Pau, available at: [http://www.centredelas.org/attachments/604\\_llibre\\_eng\\_armament.pdf](http://www.centredelas.org/attachments/604_llibre_eng_armament.pdf)
- ***Factsheet on how Israeli arms companies benefit from EU science funds*** (2009), Dave Cronin, Irish Palestinian Solidarity Campaign, available at: [http://www.ipsc.ie/pdf/ipsc\\_factsheet\\_-\\_how\\_israeli\\_arms\\_companies\\_benefit\\_from\\_eu\\_science\\_funds.pdf](http://www.ipsc.ie/pdf/ipsc_factsheet_-_how_israeli_arms_companies_benefit_from_eu_science_funds.pdf)
- ***Israel's participation in EU R&D Framework Programmes: Importing Homeland security, exporting R&D subsidies?*** (2009), Ben Hayes, Transnational Institute, available upon request
- ***European Commission Security Research website:***  
[http://ec.europa.eu/enterprise/policies/security/index\\_en.htm](http://ec.europa.eu/enterprise/policies/security/index_en.htm)

Appendix 2: Overview of Israeli participation in ESRP

| <b>Project</b> | <b>Title</b>   | <b>Theme &amp; key deliverables</b>  | <b>Israeli participants</b>   | <b>Total EU funding **</b> |
|----------------|--|--|---|----------------------------|
| TASS           | Total Airport Security System                                | Surveillance – "multisource labyrinth fusion logic enabling situational and security awareness of the airport anytime and anywhere"  | <i>Verint Systems Ltd*, Elbit Systems Ltd, Israel Airports Authority, Ernst &amp; Young Israel</i>                            | €8.98 million              |
| ESS            | Emergency Support System                                     | Security control system – "suite of real-time data-centric technologies which will provide actionable information to crisis managers during abnormal events"   | <i>Verint Systems Ltd*, Aeronautics Defense Systems Ltd., Magen David Adom (emergency services), Ernst &amp; Young Israel</i> | €14 million                |
| OPARUS         | Open Architecture for UAV-based Surveillance System          | UAVs/Drones – development of "unmanned air-to-ground wide area land and sea border surveillance platforms in Europe"   | <i>Israel Aerospace Industries</i>  | €11.88 million             |
| TALOS          | Transportable autonomous patrol for land border surveillance | Border control – "inform the Control and Command Centre and an intruder about her/his situation, and will undertake the proper measures to stop the illegal action almost autonomously with supervision of border guard officers"      | <i>Israel Aerospace Industries</i>  | €12.9 million              |
| SEABILLA       | Sea Border Surveillance                                      | Border control – "a solution that can be implemented at national and EU level to increase effectiveness, pool resources and address Maritime Security and Safety challenges; for world competitiveness of EU industries"               | <i>Correlation Systems Ltd</i>  | €9.84 million              |
| SAFIRE         | Scientific Approach to Fighting Radical Extremism            | Counter-terrorism – "improve fundamental understanding of radicalization processes and use this knowledge to develop principles to improve (the implementation) of interventions designed to prevent, halt and reverse radicalization" | <i>Israeli International Counter-Terrorism Academy</i>  | €2.91 million              |

| <b>Project</b> | <b>Title</b>   | <b>Theme &amp; key deliverables</b>  | <b>Israeli participants</b>  | <b>Total EU funding **</b> |
|----------------|--|--|--|----------------------------|
| SAFE-COMMS     | Counter-terrorism crisis communications strategies for recovery and continuity                         | Counter-terrorism – "a crisis communications manual, and series of training modules"   | <i>Bar Ilan University*</i>  | €1.09 million              |
| PREVAIL        | PRecursors of ExplosiVes   | Counter-terrorism – developing chemicals to render common ingredients in home made explosives unusable for this purpose  | <i>TECHNION (Israeli Institute of Technology)</i>  | €3.34 million              |
| EUSECON        | A new agenda for European security economics   | Homeland Security – "building new analytical and conceptual insights on the most pressing research needs in this field"  | <i>Hebrew University of Jerusalem</i>  | €2.36 million              |
| FESTOS         | Foresight of evolving security threats posed by emerging technologies                                  | Homeland Security – "continual scanning of the unfolding technology landscape for potential security threats"  | <i>Tel Aviv University* Efp Consulting Ltd (a specialist FP7 consultancy based in the UK and Israel)</i> | €1.23 million              |
| PROTECT RAIL   | Railway-Industry Partnership for Integrated Security of Rail Transport                                 | Homeland Security – "define, research and develop solutions in terms of architectures, technology deployment"  | <i>Elbit Systems Ltd</i>   | €13.11 million             |
| RIBS           | Resilient Infrastructure & Building Security   | Homeland Security – "design of effective and viable integrated security measures aimed at protecting infrastructures without impacting on their business dynamics" | <i>TECHNION (Israeli Institute of Technology)</i>  | €3.32 million              |
| IDETECT 4ALL   | Novel intruder detection & authentication optical sensing technology                                   | Surveillance – "alerting technology for surveillance and intruders detection inside and in the surrounding of Critical Infrastructures"                            | <i>Motorola Israel, CAL Cargo Airlines Ltd, Arttic Israel Company, Azimut Technologies Ltd</i>           | €2.29 million              |
| ISTEMIS        | Integrated system for transport infrastructures surveillance and monitoring by electromagnetic sensing | Surveillance – "information and images of infrastructure status to improve decision support for emergency and disasters stakeholders"                              | <i>Tel Aviv University</i>   | €3.11 million              |

| Project       | Title   | Theme & key deliverables   | Israeli participants   | Total EU funding ** |
|---------------|---|--|--|---------------------|
| CRISCOM-SCORE | Developing a crisis communication scorecard                   | Communications – "an audit instrument - a Scorecard and relevant Guides - as a tool for ensuring effective crisis communication strategies and implementation" | <i>Ben Gurion University</i>   | €0.8 million        |
| SEREN         | Security research ncp network - phase 1                       | ESRP governance – appoints MATIMOP as official ESRP contact point  | <i>MATIMOP (Israeli industry center for R&amp;D)</i>   | €0.56 million       |
| SICMA         | Simulation of crisis management activities                    | Emergency services – "computer assisted decision making for Health Service crisis managers"  | <i>Elbit Systems Ltd</i>   | €3.9 million        |
| NMFR-DISASTER | Identifying the needs of medical first responder in disasters | Emergency services – preliminary research on needs of emergency services   | <i>Maden David Adom* (emergency services)</i>  | €0.81 million       |
| INFRA         | Innovative and novel first responders applications            | Emergency services – communication systems and otehr new technologies  | <i>Athena GS3-Security Implementations Ltd*, Opgal Optronics Ltd., Arttic Israel Company</i> | €2.64 million       |

\* Denotes project leader

\*\* Total EU funding for entire project/consortium